

Migrant Street Vendors and Their Impacts in Pasar Anyar Bogor City

Seli Septiana Pratiwi

*Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia, Street. Dr Setiabudi No.229, Bandung Indonesia
seliseptiana@student.upi.edu*

Keywords: Street Vendors, Migrant.

Abstract: Social transformation is motivated by the desire to have a better life in the future. This desire encourages people to migrate. However, the people who migrate do not equip themselves with skills, causing difficulties in facing job competition. Unskilled people ultimately choose informal-sector jobs, one of them being a street vendor. The development of street vendors, especially in urban areas, causes many problems, including social disorder. This research employed a qualitative approach, the subjects of the research were street vendors who migrated from outside the city chosen as the research location. The process of collecting data by observation, interviews, and triangulation of data collection techniques. The street vendors choose public places as their selling locations, causing congestion and chaos. The chaos affects the mobility of the people. In addition, people do not get their rights as pedestrians, because the sidewalk that is intended for pedestrians has changed in its function. The people are actually not aware that they have supported the existence of the street vendors. This becomes a dilemma, where on one the one hand, the street vendors can accommodate the public needs of cheap goods, but on the other hand the existence of street vendors causes the city to be chaotic. Furthermore, these street vendors are mostly non-skilled migrants, thereby increasing the burden of the city. To solve the problem required cooperation between government, street vendors, and the community, especially for the public need awareness to not support the existence of street vendors by not becoming consumers of street vendors.

1 INTRODUCTION

Speaking about society also means speaking about various things that affect their lives. Based on the dictionary, society is defined as a group of people living together in a place or territory with certain rules of association and certain similarities. Society of course always experiences so much dynamics that social transformation cannot be avoided. Changes in the society are related to the desire for a better life in the future. Therefore, sooner or later society will change according to its future orientation.

Changes in the society, especially in urban societies, can be caused by an increasing number of populations due to migration. Giyarsih and Alfana (2013) revealed that based on the results of the 2010 census of Indonesian population there was an increase of 1.04% growth. Fertility, mortality, and migration become decisive in this phenomenon, as a major source of changes in population structure. To make matter worse, rural people who migrate tend to

not consider the importance of having job-related skills.

In the process of achieving a better future, it is not infrequent that people are involved in social mobility. Population mobility is divided into two, namely the permanent one or migration, and the non-permanent one, including circulation and commutation. The mobility is influenced by the push and pull factors. Employment is one of the factors that push people to migrate. A vision of a modern urban life, abundant employment opportunities, and the ease of getting a job are the misconceptions that affect migration.

The migrants do not understand that to enter formal employment in the cities requires them to have certain skills. Unskilled migrants ultimately choose informal-sector jobs. Mohabir et al., (2016) said that the movement of migrant workers from rural to urban areas has not only continued to happen, but it has increased due to the pressing economic reforms in private companies, tight competition, and foreign investment. According to

Law No. 25 of 1997 concerning Manpower Affairs, informal-sector business is the activity of an individual or a family, or several people carrying out a joint effort to conduct economic activities on the basis of trust and agreement, and without legal entity.

One of the informal-sector jobs is a street vendor. Bhowmik (2012) also Bromley (2000) mentioned that street vendors are an important element of the urban informal economy. The migrant street vendors who are deemed to have succeeded and are financially stable then invite their families and relatives to join them to work in the city. The migrants who take their family or relatives do not pay attention to their relatives' expertise. The success that has been achieved in the city as street vendors becomes the reason for the family members and relatives of the migrant street vendors to also work in urban areas. They share the same belief that the city can be a solution to improve the family economic well-being.

Subsequently, the migrants who join the street vendors who have previously come to the city collect some business capital to open similar businesses, namely to be street vendors. This becomes a continuous pattern and there seems to be no end to it. Bhowmik (2012) argued that despite many efforts by the government to eradicate them, street vendors remain a rapidly growing phenomenon in many cities due to the demands of low-income people for cheap goods. In certain countries at a particular political moment, street vendors can defend themselves from the government's efforts to remove them from urban public spaces. It is indeed undeniable that there are many regulations that prohibit the existence of street vendors, especially in certain areas.

The capital expended by street vendors is not big compared to the sellers occupying the authorized stalls. Still, however, street vendors have to pay some costs, such as unofficial retribution for space renting and security. Their existence also disadvantages the pedestrians, as the street vendors use the space that is destined for pedestrians. Permatasari et al., (2013) reported that the presence of street vendors in large cities is quite disturbing the community. The street vendors usually choose to trade in public places, causing sidewalks to switch in their functions. In addition, the roads for motor vehicles are sometimes used as their selling places. This use of public space has caused reduced mobility for the people.

The choice of selling places then causes many problems, especially related to orderliness. Issues

regarding hygiene, safety, and disorder around the spaces used by the street vendors cannot be avoided. This is due to a shift in the functions of the places, such as sidewalks and roads. Heaps of garbage, puddles, theft, and congestion are always found around the places where the street vendors do their business. Careful observation reveals that these street vendors come from the same region, and their number has continued to increase. A number of regulations governing migration and the existence of street vendors are considered unable to suppress the increasing number of migration and street vendors. In handling street vendors, the government as a regulator and policy maker requires cooperation from the community, so the policies that govern the street vendors can function properly.

Previous research focused more on the impact generated by the presence of street vendors and the efforts made to overcome the presence of street vendors. In this study not only discuss about the effect of the existence of street vendors but also discussed that the problem of street vendors should be coupled with the government attention to the flow of migration. This research sees that the problem of street vendors is related to the migration by community, especially the unskilled community.

Looking at the reality that there should be questioned how the process and factors behind the arrival of migrant's street vendors? The existence of street vendors will surely disrupt social order, so it is actually anything what factors cause migrant street vendors choose to sell at public facilities and caused social order? Disruption of activities undertaken by the community certainly needs the handling of relevant parties to address the issue of street vendors, what to do in an effort to curb migrant street vendors? In answering these question, a more in-depth study of the where about of migrant street vendors is required.

2 METHODS

The research employed a qualitative approach with the case study method. Qualitative approach was chosen because the researcher would like to see the relationship between migration and the presence of street vendors; hence, an in-depth approach is needed. Secondly, the researcher would like to find the problems caused by the presence of the street vendors that influence people's lives. Thirdly, the qualitative approach was selected to allow for the emergence of new problems during the research, which is in line with the researcher's desire to see

the problems related to social order due to the presence of street vendors and how they affect the lives of the surrounding communities. As noted by Creswell (2015), qualitative research is well suited to address the research issues that need to be explored to gain an in-depth understanding.

In addition, case study method was chosen because the present research took place in Pasar Anyar, Bogor city. The selection of this research site was prompted by the fact that the backgrounds of the street vendors are known and they are given continuous supervision by the BUMD (Region-Owned Enterprises) of Bogor city, which in this case is the PD. Pasar Pakuan Jaya. Furthermore, compared to other traditional markets in Bogor city, the number of visitors of Pasar Anyar is greater because it is the ultimate destination for some of the city's public transportation routes. Therefore, the street vendors who sell their products in Pasar Anyar, Bogor city, have more advantages compared to other street vendors. It is because of these advantages that the researcher chose to use the case study method. Another reason is that Bogor city is one of the cities in the buffer zone to the capital city with fewer traditional markets, located in close proximity to each other. Creswell (2007) revealed that case study research seeks to provide an in-depth understanding of the case or comparison of some cases. Such cases enable the involvement of individuals, groups, programs, events, or activities.

This study uses observation data collection techniques, interviews, literature study and triangulation of data collection techniques. The observations were made to see the true conditions of migrant street vendors in their daily lives. Interviews are used to extract information that can't be obtained through observation. Library study was conducted to complete the research data through the literature related to the research problem and triangulation of data collection techniques were conducted to complement the field facts of the observation and interview activities. Data analysis was performed by means of data reduction, data presentation, and data verification.

3 RESULTS

Pasar Anyar in Bogor city was established in 1881. The Management of Pasar Anyar Bogor has changed several times. Once managed by the Department of Trade, Industry, and Cooperatives (Disperinkop) of Bogor city, currently the market is managed by two parties, the government and private parties. Pasar

Anyar in Bogor city is a traditional market that belongs to the category of class I. The classification of Class I market means that Pasar Anyar is equipped with complete facilities; a good flow of goods and people, both inside and outside

Pasar Anyar in Bogor city is included under the Unit of Pasar Kebon Kembang. Since *Peraturan Daerah (Perda)* Bogor city No.13 Year 2005 concerning the Management of Street Vendors, the street vendors in Pasar Anyar must move from their business location, and if they still want to do business in the same location they should have the permission from Bogor Mayor or the appointed official. Therefore, the street vendors in Pasar Anyar, Bogor city, is divided into two, namely one under the government, which in this case managed by PD. Pakuan Jaya Market, and another one under the private sector, in this case managed by Paguyuban PKL or the association of street vendors. The Association consists of street vendors who feel disadvantaged by the Bogor city Regulation of No.13 of 2005.

There are 217 merchants under the management of the Unit of Pasar Kebon Kembang. The street vendors under the management of Pasar Kebon Kembang Unit are referred to as "pedagang binaan" or literally supervised merchants which are spread around block A, B, E, F, and G. Meanwhile, the street vendors belonging to the Association are spread from the front of block C and D, the front of the grand mosque, the front and side parts of Plaza Dewi Sartika, and the front of the kiosk buildings after the train crossing. The merchants under the management of Pasar Kebon Kembang sell goods in the forms of wholesale shoes, sandals, apparels, and textiles, different from the street vendors under the Association who sell vegetables, fruits, sea catch, ready-to-eat food and drinks, and household utensils.

The street vendors under the management of the Unit of Pasar Kebon Kembang are governed by a number of regulations made by the Market Unit. These regulations include market security, environmental hygiene, and fees for the use of market facilities. Each item of the fees is managed in a structured manner, where there are officers who are assigned to collect the fees, and how the fees paid are spent is made transparent. Therefore, there are sanctions for traders who damage the market facilities and fail to pay the fees for a certain period of time. The regulations concerning the kinds of fees to pay are almost the same as those for the street vendors under the Paguyuban or association, in which the traders are required to pay a certain amount of fees for basic costs, security, and hygiene.

Based on the primary data obtained through interviews and observations, it is found that the majority of the migrant street vendors, especially those under the management of Pasar Kebon Kembang Unit, come from outside West Java. They mostly come from Padang, Medan, and East Java. There are also migrant street vendors originating from several areas in West Java, Central Java, and other regions of Sumatra and Kalimantan. The migrants were motivated to migrate, especially to Bogor city, primarily because their family members have previously migrated there. In addition, there are also migrants who migrate because of a better business opportunity in Bogor city and because they have friends from the same place of origin in Bogor. Vioya (2010) concluded that the population density in the Jabodetabek (Jakarta, Bogor, Depok, Tangerang, Bekasi) Metropolitan regions continued to increase from 1987 to 2007, despite a slight decline in 2001. Seen from the density of population per regency and city, the population density in this core area tends to decrease, but the level of density of the outer circle has increased.

Population migration is currently not only targeting the capital city of Jakarta but also the buffer areas, including Bogor city. Actually, when the migrants move, some of them are able to get a better job, even if the family members or relatives who brought them have succeeded by working as street vendors. In general, the reason for choosing this job as a street vendor is because of the small amount of business capital needed, the fact that their family members have initiated the business, and because they have no skills to work in other fields. The job as a street vendor pioneered by the family members in the end attracts the migrants to conduct a similar business or to participate in developing the family business already established.

The migrants should actually adapt to urban living, because the conditions of the city, the values, and norms in urban areas are different from those in their place of origin. Parson stated that the AGIL-scheme in the structural- functional theory shows four requirements that must be met by the social system, namely adaptation, goal attainment, integration, Latent Pattern Maintenance. In this regard, Ritzer and Goodman (2010) explained that the main target of societal functionalists is the social structure and the large-scale public institutions, their interrelationships, and their influence on the actors.

Based on the theories, the family members or relatives who already moved to the destined area will provide support to the other migrants in the process of their adaptation. In addition, the presence

of family members and relatives facilitates communication with the native residents. Without the help of their family members or relatives, the migrants may have difficulties in communicating with the native residents because their language is certainly different from the one used in the new place. The migrants should be able to understand local languages in order to build good social relationships for migration purposes. The presence of street vendors in Bogor city then affects many aspects of community life.

3.1 The Shifting Functions of the Public Facilities

The migrants who choose to work as street vendors in Pasar Kebon Kembang Unit have special reasons for choosing this place as a selling location. One of them is because Pasar Kebon Kembang Unit is visited by many people, thus facilitating the process of buying and selling. In facilitating street vendors, stalls or kiosks are needed to display their goods. The stalls used by the street vendors then crowd the public facilities, hampering the mobility of pedestrians and motor vehicles. However, the community has actually unconsciously supported the existence of these street vendors, although their presence disadvantages them, especially the road users.

The kind of support given by people is in the form of more frequent shopping from street vendors compared to shopping from the kiosks inside the building. This habit certainly makes it difficult for the government as a policy maker, although the government has made a number of rules to discipline these street vendors in the hope that people can get their rights as road users and the functions of public facilities can be restored. The people also need to realize that their behaviour is a violation of the rules set by the government.

3.2 Congestion

The chaos around the location of the migrant street vendors is indeed unavoidable, as long as the street vendors do their business, then congestion will occur. The existence of street vendors has created narrower roads and sidewalks, because when made into a trade centre, the community's activity at these locations is very high. Public transportation adds to the congestion by stopping or driving slowly to drop and pick up passengers. In addition, congestion is caused by many vehicles that are parked carelessly

so that the roads become increasingly narrow and disorganized.

3.3 Hygiene

Likewise, hygiene around the location of migrant street vendors is poorly maintained. The placement of adjacent selling facilities makes it difficult to control the hygiene of the selling locations. Trash is often seen to be accumulated on the corners; puddles are difficult to remove because they will impact on the surrounding sales stalls. The puddles block water circulation, causing flooding when it rains. Setiadi and Usman (2011) reported that the street vendors in Pasar Anyar, Bogor, is included under a group of individuals with behavioural deviations that become “problems” for themselves and for others.

Based on the primary data in the form of interviews, it is indicated that the migrant street vendors in Pasar Kebon Kembang Unit always get coaching/supervision, especially related to the hygiene and security around the selling location. The market managers provide bins around the selling locations. This is to keep the garbage from getting piled up on the corners of the selling locations or along the road. The merchants are also always reminded to clean the selling location when they have finished with their activities. The merchants who are members of the management of Pasar Kebon Kembang Unit are regulated by the managers in establishing their business. This is to facilitate the process of monitoring traders and market visitors.

Although a landfill has been provided, the merchants’ selling locations are not completely clean of garbage. In addition to trading activities, the visitors’ habit of littering also causes a lot of trash along the merchants’ selling locations. Nasution and Hasibuan (2016) explained that the necessary cooperation between officers and the community provides the motivation and responsibility of each party on the importance of protecting the environment from waste. Based on the primary data in the form of observations, it is found that there are no puddles around the merchants’ trading locations, because the traders coat the floors of the selling locations with wooden boards. This is different from the situation of the selling locations of the traders under the Association, garbage from trading activities and thrown by visitors pile up there. In addition, puddles of water due to trading activities are visible. This behaviour affects buyers’ convenience when shopping.

3.4 Security

The security around the location of selling is also a concern of the managers of street vendors, both the management of Pasar Kebon Kembang Unit and the Paguyuban or association. Each manages to place security officers to protect the public from possible criminal acts. Nevertheless, it is not rare that thefts happen to buyers, particularly when the location of selling is packed with buyers. People who shop need to keep attention to their belonging, because the security officers who have been placed in the location cannot always keep their eyes on every visitor.

Based on the primary data from observations, it appears that the security guards are always in patrol, but when the market is very crowded, the mobility of these officers becomes difficult, especially to reach the middle location of the market. The officers are also difficult to monitor the visitors one by one during busy days due to the limited number of the security personnel. When the market is very busy, security guards will patrol outside or at locations that are easy to reach.

Although the migrant street vendors are under the management of the Unit of Pasar Kebon Kembang, it does not mean that these vendors are allowed to sell there permanently. The government is preparing possible efforts to regulate the migrant street vendors and restore the function of public facilities. The government’s policy must be a win-win solution, especially for the life of the community.

3.4.1 Regional Regulations

To overcome the problem of migrant street vendors, Bogor Municipality Government makes a number of regulations such as Regional Regulation No. 8 of 2006 on Social Order and Regional Regulation of Bogor city No.13 Year 2005 on the Regulation of Street Vendors. Both regulations stipulated by the Government of Bogor city are expected to suppress the number of migrant street vendors in the city of Bogor. The implementation of the regulations, of course, requires cooperation from the community.

3.4.2 The Regulations by Virtue of Perda No.8 Year 2006 concerning Social Order

The government as the regulator and policy maker has actually made an effort in disciplining or regulating street vendors, including the Municipal

Government of Bogor which issued the Regional Regulation (Perda) No. 8 of 2006 on Social Order. A number of regulations have been made, including sanctions granted to traders as well as buyers. However, the habit of buyers to shop from street vendors is difficult to change, not to mention the fact that the street vendors also offer a cheaper price than the authorized merchants. The regulation of the street vendors has also been attempted by the government, which in this case is implemented by the Civil Service Police Unit (Satpol PP). The Unit of Pasar Kebon Kembang also frequently makes arrangement of the traders and measures the stalls so as not to block the way.

A different situation can be observed from the street vendors under the management of the Paguyuban or Association. The street vendors become the target of the disciplinary operation of Satpol PP, and even on several occasions the selling location of the street vendors is guarded by the officers. This condition causes traders to do "hide and seek" with the officers. The traders also have no plans to be relocated to the kiosks inside the market building. This is a dilemma because the merchants need a place to earn a living and the buyers need the goods at a cheaper price and a closer place to buy the goods. Based on the primary data from the interviews, the policy made by the government in controlling street vendors is meaningless, because the community as an aggrieved party has actually supported the existence of the street vendors. Therefore, cooperation of the community in implementing the policies that have been made by the government is necessary.

3.4.3 Relocation

Based on the primary data from the interviews, the managers are making a strategy to move these traders to the kiosks in the building and also change the habits of the visitors from shopping from street vendors to shopping at authorized merchants. The strategy is necessary because the visitors of the market who have been accustomed to shopping from street vendors can continue shopping from other street vendors instead of from the authorized merchants when the old street vendors are relocated. This certainly will disadvantage the merchants who have been relocated, as they will have no visitors.

The government wants all migrant street vendors in Bogor city to become authorized traders or merchants who occupy the kiosks in the building Market. The traders need to cooperate with the government if not all traders can be accommodated

in the same location. This is so because the number of street vendors is not proportional to the capacity of the market building. The government has had several discussions with migrant street vendors in solving the problem of relocation, but has not found a solution, because the traders refused to relocate to a new place that is considered far from community activities.

A similar strategy was previously implemented by the Government of Lamogan Regency, in which traders refused to relocate to a new location due to the price of the kiosks in the new market, their pessimism to compete in Pasar Baru Babat, and the requirement to pay monthly retribution [15]. Rejection is unavoidable, especially considering the street vendors in the city of Bogor are planned to be relocated to market buildings far enough from the location of Pasar Anyar, so the traders object to the suggestion and become pessimistic if they will get as many customers or buyers in the new place as in Pasar Anyar. What is feared by the street vendors in Pasar Anyar has actually been experienced by the street vendors on Jalan Raya Magelang-Yogyakarta 5-8, in that the welfare of the street vendors after relocation, primarily in terms of income and the ability to save, decreased.

Indeed, relocation is one way to regulate the migrant street vendors in Bogor city and also to implement the Regional Regulation No.8 of 2006 on Social Order. However, the migrant street vendors are hoping that another effort will be made by the government as a win-win solution. Moreover, these migrants depend on the income of being street vendors for their living. The migrant street vendors in Pasar Anyar Bogor, either under the management of Pasar Kebon Kembang Unit and under the management of Paguyuban, have no other expertise than trading.

3.4.4 Communication between the Government and Migrant Street Vendors

Communication between the government and migrant street vendors should be opened to exchange information about the expectations of both parties. In this case, the community also needs to be involved in the process of policy making. Especially on the relocation problem, there should be a win-win solution for both migrant street vendors and the community represented by the government. Bogor city Government which handles the problem of migrant street vendors can learn the lesson in handling street vendors from the case of Sempadan

Avfoer Bono, where the government did not have good communication with the street vendors, especially in making policy, causing the people around the location of the street vendors to be directly affected. Communication is not only for the regulation of migrant street vendors in Bogor city but also as an educational effort for the community in terms of migration control.

4 CONCLUSIONS

The analysis of the impact of migrant street vendors on the society shows that many problems arise because of street vendors, whether directly or indirectly affecting the community. The direct impacts include reduced mobility, both for pedestrians and road users. The indirect impacts, among others, include the increasing number of street vendors, of which the communities are not aware, causing the burden of the region to increase. The presence of migrant street vendors makes the city look chaotic, especially in terms of the shifting functions of public facilities, environmental hygiene, security, and congestion that always occur when the activity of these street vendors takes place. The government as the regulator and policy maker has made various efforts in disciplining street vendors, including regulations governing traders and buyers in street vendors, relocation, and communication with migrant street vendors. Cooperation is needed from all parties, namely the government, street vendors, and community, to solve this problem. People also need to realize that buying from street vendors is an activity that violates the rules and indirectly supports the existence of street vendors.

Based on the research results are negative implications due to the presence of migrant street vendors in Pasar Anyar Bogor city. Recommendations that can be given to the policy makers that before the policy is taken on migrant street vendors should be analyzed in depth from the socio-economic aspects of migrant street vendors, and for further research is expected to explore more deeply about the presence of street vendors, especially in Bogor city.

REFERENCES

- Bhowmik, S., 2012. *Street vendors in the global urban economy*, Taylor & Francis. Abingdon-On-Thames.
- Bromley, R., 2000. Street vending and public policy: a global review. *International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy*. 20(1/2), 1-28.
- Creswell, J., 2015. *Riset Pendidikan (Educational Research)*, Pustaka Pelajar. Yogyakarta.
- Creswell, J. W., 2007. *Research Desain Pendekatan Kualitatif, Kuantitatif, dan Mixed (Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Approaches)*, Pustaka Pelajar. Yogyakarta.
- Giyarsih, S. R., Alfana, M. A. F., 2013. The Role of Urban Area as the Determinant Factor of Population Growth. *Indonesian Journal of Geography*. 45, 38-47.
- Mohabir, N., Jiang. Y., Ma, R., 2017. Chinese floating migrants: Rural-urban migrant labourer's intentions to stay or return. *Habitat International*. 60, 101-110.
- Nasution, S. I., Hasibuan, M. A., 2016. Peran Dinas Pasar Kabupaten Deli Serdang dalam Meningkatkan Kebersihan Pasar Galang (The role of the Department of Market Management of Deli Serdang Regency in increasing the hygiene of Pasar Galang). *Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan dan Sosial Politik UMA*. 4, 118-131.
- Permatasari, A., Putro, U. S., Nuraeni, S., 2014. Strategic Analysis Relocating Street Vendor through 3D Negotiation Case Study: Street Vendor Surakarta, Indonesia. *Procedia – Social and Behavioral Sciences*. 115(Icices 2013), 436-443.
- Ritzer, G., Goodman, D. J., 2010. *Teori Sosiologi Modern (Modern Sociological Theory)*, Kencana. Jakarta.
- Setiadi, E. M., Usman, K., 2011. *Pengantar Sosiologi (Introduction to Sociology)*, Kencana. Jakarta.
- Vioya, A., 2010. Tahapan Perkembangan Kawasan Metropolitan Jakarta (The development stages of Jakarta Metropolitan Area). *Jurnal Perencanaan Wilayah dan Kota*. 21, 215-226.